

## PERTH AND KINROSS COUNCIL

## Crieff Common Good Fund Committee

16 December 2015

## Crieff Civic Chairs

## Report by Service Manager, Culture (Education and Children's Services)

**PURPOSE OF REPORT**

This report seeks the consideration by the Committee of the options appraisal on future proposals for a set of civic chairs originally belonging to Crieff Burgh Council, and approval of the recommendations arising from the options appraisal.

**1. BACKGROUND / MAIN ISSUES**

- 1.1 A set of 14 oak and upholstered chairs were originally used by Crieff Burgh Council in Crieff Town Hall for Council business, but have not been in use for several years. The set comprises a Provost's chair, two Magistrates' armchairs and 11 Councillors' chairs. The Head of Legal Services has advised that, although the chairs are the property of the Council, they form part of the Common Good of Crieff.
- 1.2 In response to community concern regarding storage of the chairs within the basement of Crieff Town Hall, they were moved to Perth Museum and Art Gallery in May 2015 for assessment by the Museums and Galleries curatorial staff. They currently remain in Museum storage. The present condition of the majority of the chairs excludes any immediate re-use.
- 1.3 The local community would like to see a viable future for the chairs, and consultation with the Crieff and Strathearn Heritage Steering Group has focused on the options.
- 1.4 An Object Report was prepared by the Museums and Galleries Service in June 2015, which assessed the chairs' history, provenance and condition, see **Appendix 2**. The chairs are generally in a fair condition but the current cost of restoring them is estimated to be from £1540-£1680 for basic cleaning, to £4480-£5320 for total restoration. The cost of this could be met by an application to the Crieff Common Good Fund.
- 1.5 Public consultation was carried out, with two of the chairs being displayed in Strathearn Community Campus Library from 31 July 2015 for six weeks. The consultation form explained the current ownership, gave key information such as conservation costs (based on 2012 costs, now revised- **see Appendix 3**) and requested suggestions from the public about what should happen to the chairs in the future. The findings are summarised in **Section 2.3**.

## 2 PROPOSALS

- 2.1 As stated, the Object Report took account of the condition of all the chairs and suggested options for future use, including display in a relevant museum or display in a community location within Crieff or the surrounding area.
- 2.2 Community consultation resulted in a total of 26 responses received via the suggestion box within Strathearn Community Campus and by email. The summary table below presents the feedback in broad categories (where an individual response included more than one suggestion they have been counted as a responder in more than one of the summary of findings categories):

<b>Summary of findings from community consultation</b>	<b>Respondent (s) (1-26)</b>	<b>Total number of responses</b>
The Provost's chair should be accessioned into Perth and Kinross Council's Collection	1, 3, 4, 6, 14	5
All 14 chairs should be kept together with ownership and responsibility transferring to Crieff Community Council	2, 8, 10, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24	9
All/some of the chairs should be transferred to Crieff Community Council for use locally  Suggestions for future use included: in a meeting room at Crieff Hydro/in a local meeting hub/Town Hall/library/a meeting room at St Michael's church/for Crieff Council business	3, 4, 7, 13, 17, 23, 24, 25	8
All or some of the chairs should be sold  Suggestions for the proceeds from the sale included: add to the Common Good Fund/use for heritage projects/donate to a well-known charity	1, 6, 12, 14, 16	5
All 14 of the chairs should be refurbished for use and/or display  Suggestions for funding this included: Common Good Fund/Community Council/raise funds locally/plea should be made for a local upholsterer to renovate	3, 5, 11, 7, 19, 20, 21, 23	8
None of the chairs should be sold	8, 9	2
A museum could be created in the Crieff Clock Tower/put them in a small museum in Crieff	4, 11	2
Provost's chair and at least one example of each of the Magistrate's and a Councillor's chair could be restored and put on display in a glass case in the Campus	15	1

### 3 OPTIONS APPRAISAL

- 3.1 In September 2015 Crieff Community Council agreed that it would be willing to take on ownership and responsibility for the chairs. The Head of Legal Services has confirmed that there is no legal impediment to this and it has been considered with other options as set out in **Appendix 1**. It has emerged as the recommended option.
- 3.2 If the recommended option of all 14 chairs being transferred to Crieff Community Council is approved this would enable them to continue to be accessible by the wider community which might be considered to be of benefit to the local inhabitants.

### 4 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION(S)

- 4.1 It is recommended that the Committee:
- i. Approves the recommendation that the ownership for all 14 of the chairs is transferred to Crieff Community Council (ref **Option 2**), on the understanding that they will be responsible for ensuring they are maintained, refurbished and made accessible to the local community.

#### Author(s)

Name	Designation	Contact Details
Jenny Kinnear	Project Officer, Collections Management	01738 483410 <a href="mailto:JKinnear@pkc.gov.uk">JKinnear@pkc.gov.uk</a>

#### Approved

Name	Designation	Date
John Fyffe	Senior Depute Chief Executive Equality, Community Planning & Public Sector Reform	7 December 2015

If you or someone you know would like a copy of this document in another language or format, (on occasion, only a summary of the document will be provided in translation), this can be arranged by contacting the Customer Service Centre on 01738 475000.

You can also send us a text message on 07824 498145.

All Council Services can offer a telephone translation facility.

## 1. IMPLICATIONS, ASSESSMENTS, CONSULTATION AND COMMUNICATION

<b>Strategic Implications</b>	<b>Yes / None</b>
Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement	<b>Yes</b>
Corporate Plan	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Resource Implications</b>	
Financial	<b>No</b>
Workforce	<b>No</b>
Asset Management (land, property, IST)	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Assessments</b>	
Equality Impact Assessment	<b>No</b>
Strategic Environmental Assessment	<b>No</b>
Sustainability (community, economic, environmental)	<b>No</b>
Legal and Governance	<b>No</b>
Risk	<b>No</b>
<b>Consultation</b>	
Internal	<b>Yes</b>
External	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Communication</b>	
Communications Plan	<b>None</b>

### 1. Strategic Implications

#### Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement

1.1 This report supports the achievement of the following Perth and Kinross Community Plan Strategic Objectives:

- Supporting a prosperous, inclusive and sustainable economy.
- Supporting people to lead independent, healthy and active lives

#### Corporate Plan

1.2 Perth and Kinross Council Corporate Plan 2013-18 sets out five strategic objectives:

- (i) Giving every child the best start in life;
- (ii) Developing educated, responsible and informed citizens;
- (iii) Promoting a prosperous, inclusive and sustainable economy;
- (iv) Supporting people to lead independent, healthy and active lives; and
- (v) Creating a safe and sustainable place for future generations

This report relates to Objectives (iii) and (iv)

### 2. Resource Implications

#### Financial

- 2.1 Financial implications include the cost of refurbishment (estimated at up to £5320).

#### Workforce

- 2.2 This report reflects our commitment to work with communities, and to retain local heritage within the local community where viable. However, there are no workforce resource implications as a result of this report.

#### Asset Management (land, property, IST)

- 2.3 The information contained in this report will have implications for the ownership and management of the set of Crieff civic chairs.

### **3. Assessments**

#### Equality Impact Assessment

- 3.1 Under the Equality Act 2010, the Council is required to eliminate discrimination, advance equality of opportunity, and foster good relations between equality groups. Carrying out Equality Impact Assessments for plans and policies allows the Council to demonstrate that it is meeting these duties.

This section should reflect that the proposals have been considered under the Corporate Equalities Impact Assessment process (EqIA) with the following outcome:

- (i) Assessed as not relevant for the purposes of EqIA.

#### Strategic Environmental Assessment

- 3.2 The Environmental Assessment (Scotland) Act 2005 places a duty on the Council to identify and assess the environmental consequences of its proposals. These have been considered under the Act and no action is required as the Act does not apply to the matters presented in this report.

#### Sustainability

- 3.3 Under the provisions of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 the Council has to discharge its duties in a way which contributes to the achievement of sustainable development. In terms of the Climate Change Act, the Council has a general duty to demonstrate its commitment to sustainability and the community, environmental and economic impacts of its actions.

The information contained within this report has been considered under the Act. However, no action is required as the Act does not apply to the matters presented in this report.

#### Legal and Governance

- 3.4 There are no legal or governance issues associated with this report.

## Risk

- 3.5 There are no specific risks associated with this report.

## **4. Consultation**

### Internal

- 4.1 Head of Service, Culture and Community Services – correct job title  
Head of Legal Services, Perth & Kinross Council  
Head of Finance, Perth & Kinross Council

### External

- 4.2 Consultation has taken place with the local community by way of a six week consultation period regarding options for the future of the chairs. Discussions have also taken place at the meetings of Crieff and Strathearn Heritage Steering Group, who include representatives from:
- Crieff Community Council
  - Innerpefferay Library
  - The Tourist Association
  - Local residents

## **5. Communication**

The decision regarding the future of the chairs will be shared with local groups at the Crieff and Strathearn Heritage Steering Group meetings and with the wider community via local press.

## **2. BACKGROUND PAPERS**

No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above report.

## **3. APPENDICES**

**Appendix 1** - Options Appraisal for Crieff Civic Chairs

**Appendix 2** - Object Report- Crieff Chairs

**Appendix 3** - Conservation Report by Fran Malloy, updated to 2015 costs

**Appendix 4** – Sample public consultation

Crieff Civic Chairs

Options Appraisal

Option	Risk	Benefit	Recommendation
<p>1. All 14 chairs are transferred to the Perth and Kinross Council collection</p>	<p>Potential for negative community response as objects not retained within the local community.</p>	<p>All 14 chairs are cared for and preserved to museum standards.</p>	<p>Not recommended as not desirable for the entire set of chairs to enter the PKC collection due to duplication, poor condition of the objects and storage and access issues (ref PKC Collections Development Policy).</p>
<p>2. All 14 chairs become the responsibility of Crieff Community Council</p>	<p>The current condition of the set of chairs means further investment would be required in order that they could be used or displayed.  A suitable location for storage/use of display would have to be identified.  The Provost's chair would not be cared for to Museum and Gallery standards (as recommended in the Object Report- Appendix 2)</p>	<p>All 14 chairs are retained in Crieff and following investment can be made accessible to the local community.</p>	<p><b>This option is recommended*</b>  It recognises the majority opinion received from the public consultation, to retain all the chairs together and locally, with the aim to refurbish them for future use and/or display. (ref 2.3 in attached report).  Crieff Community Council have already agreed they would be willing to take on the ownership and responsibility for the chairs (ref CCC minutes of meeting 7/9/15).</p>
<p>3. The Provost's chair is transferred to the Council's collection <i>and</i> the other 13 become responsibility of Crieff</p>	<p>Potential negative community response if Provost's chair is not retained locally and not kept with the rest of the set  The current condition of the</p>	<p>This recognises the significance of the Provost's chair and would ensure its long- term preservation, care and display.  Following investment, the 13</p>	<p>Not recommended in light of feedback from public consultation- which showed a desire for the set of chairs to be kept together.</p>

Option	Risk	Benefit	Recommendation
Community Council	<p>other 13 chairs means further investment would be required in order that they could be used or displayed.</p> <p>A suitable location for storage/use of display would have to be identified.</p>	chairs could be retained within the local community for use/display.	
4. The Provost's Chair is transferred to the Council's collection and the other 13 are disposed of (eg by transfer, gift, sale)	<p>Provost's chair -as above.</p> <p>13 chairs- negative public opinion re disposal of PKC assets/loss of items of significance to local community.</p>	<p>Provost's chair -as above.</p> <p>13 chairs- no investment required.</p>	Not recommended on the basis of the potential risk of negative public opinion re sale and reputational damage to the Council.
5. All 14 chairs are disposed of (eg by transfer, gift, sale)	Negative public opinion re disposal of PKC assets/loss of items of significance to local community.	No investment required and funds raised	Not recommended on the basis of the potential risk of negative public opinion re sale and reputational damage to the Council.

\* NOTE: The recommended option (2) may involve a potential funding bid to Crieff Common Good Fund for the refurbishment of the chairs.

It would also require Crieff Community Council to:


- Identify a suitable location for the immediate relocation and storage of the chairs
- Raise the necessary funds to refurbish the chairs
- Secure long-term storage and/or identify a suitable location for the use/display of the chairs, with associated costs



## Crieff Civic Chairs

**Perth and Kinross Council**  
**Culture Services**  
**Museums and Galleries Service**  
**OBJECT REPORT**

<b>Name</b>	Rhona Rodger	<b>Date completed</b>	24.6.2015
<b>Position</b>	Senior Collections Officer		
<b>Object description</b>	<p>Set of 14 solid oak, civic chairs from Crieff including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provost's chair with Crieff Council motto carving</li> <li>• Two magistrates armchairs with rosette carvings</li> <li>• 11 councillor's chairs</li> </ul>		
<b>History and Provenance</b>	<p>Initial research suggests that the chairs were designed and produced by East Brothers of Dundee. The company operated between 1895 and 1986 (awaiting further information to confirm if this attribution is correct).</p> <p>The chairs originally belonged to Crieff Burgh Council and were used in the Town Hall for council business. Under the care of PKC they have remained there in storage in the basement.</p> <p>The chairs were brought to Perth Museum and Art Gallery in May 2015 at the request of the community and are now stored in stable conditions in the furniture store.</p>		
<b>Condition</b>	<p>The chairs are in an overall fair condition. They have no sign of infestation but require cleaning and there are various dents and scratches to the wood on all chairs. The leather is worn and in very poor condition with cuts, tears and some previous attempts at repair.</p> <p>The Provost's chair if accessioned could go on display after cleaning.</p> <p>The level of work on the thirteen chairs which would not be accepted by the museum for the collection depends on their future use. If used as working chairs they would require complete re-upholstering as the leather is dry, cracked and torn.</p> <p>The cost of restoring the chairs was previously identified by Fran Malloy in 2012 and the estimate given was £3,460.*</p> <p>This would involve –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Removal of studs and leather</li> <li>• Repair stuffing</li> <li>• Clean, remove scratches and dents, reseal and finish wax</li> <li>• Re-cover the seats and back pads with similar style/colour of leather</li> <li>• Re-stud</li> </ul>		
<b>Significance-issues to consider</b>	The chairs are of historical significance to Crieff and the civic		

	<p>business of the town and are of importance to the local community. This has been demonstrated through discussions with Strathearn and Crieff Heritage Steering Group.</p>
<p><b>Options for long term care</b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Taking into account the historical significance and condition of the chairs, Perth &amp; Kinross Museums and Galleries Service will accession only the Provost's chair into the museum collection but not the other thirteen. This decision, based on museum storage being at a premium and the chairs poor condition, is in line with the PKC Collections Development Policy 2015-2020. The Provost's chair would become part of the holdings of Perth &amp; Kinross Museums and Galleries Service and decisions regarding future display and storage would be in line with museum standards of care.</li> <li>2. The Provost's chair could then be considered for display within the Strathearn and Crieff area, with potential venues including Strathearn Community Campus and/or Innerpefferay Library, subject to satisfactory environmental and security conditions, and public access arrangements</li> <li>3. The thirteen chairs that will not be taken into the museum collection could be restored for future use within Strathearn and Crieff, but please note indicative costs above.</li> <li>4. Options for storage of the thirteen chairs could be investigated with PKC Property Services, or a venue could be found for them within Crieff, at the recommendation of Strathearn and Crieff Heritage Steering Group.</li> <li>5. Proposals for use or display of the chairs from any relevant group would be considered in consultation with groups such as Crieff Community Council and Strathearn and Crieff Heritage Steering Group.</li> </ol>
<p><b>Images</b></p>	 <p>Provost's chair</p>



Magistrate's chair with rosette carving



Councillor's chairs



\*This cost was revised by the conservator on 19/11/15- see Appendix 3





FRAN MALLOY FURNITURE.  
CONSERVATION. RESTORATION. COURSES

72 Brackenrig Crescent,  
Waterfoot,  
GLASGOW.  
G76 0HF

Telephone : 0141 644 1421  
www.franmalloy.co.uk

**FAO :**

19<sup>th</sup> November 2015

Jenny Kinnear,  
Project Officer : Collections Management,  
Culture and Community Services,  
Perth and Kinross Council,  
78 George Street,  
PERTH.  
PH1 5LB

**AMMENDED WORK REPORT / COST ESTIMATE.**

**RESTORATION OF A SUITE OF FORMAL ARMCHAIRS FROM CRIEFF COUNCIL, - dated April 2012.**  
(As seen on; 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2012).

**Description.**

Set of fourteen upright upholstered armchairs.  
All well constructed/jointed of solid oak timber.  
Eleven armchairs plainly finished/no carving, two with rosette carving to back top rail and one with the Crieff council motto carved in back top rail.  
Timber finished with clear seal.  
Seat and back pads traditionally upholstered, covered in brown leather and finished with brass-studding.

**Location.**

When seen, stored in the basement of the Crieff Tourist Information Office /Shop /Museum.

Now with PMAG.

**Condition.**

No signs of insect infestation or excessive mould growth evident.  
Timber construction structurally sound, - apart from minor wobbles.  
Various dents and scratches to show-wood, in some places through surface seal into timber.

As far as can be seen, internal stuffing of seats and back pads is in fair condition.  
The leather covering is in poor condition, minimum damage; well worn, maximum damage; torn/cut through to stuffing and in some places these tears have been previously repaired with gaffer tape.

**Restoration Options / Costs .**

**Option One:**

**-future storage only.**

If the armchairs are not to be displayed, find a suitable location for their future storage.

Ideally this would be a location with more floor space available allowing the chairs to be stored without stacking.

(Note - previous stacking/moving/re-stacking has most probably caused some of the dents/scratches to the woodwork and possibly some of the leather damage).

Before storage both the leather and woodwork of the chairs should be cleaned with a mild detergent/disinfectant. Once thoroughly dry, the leather can be given a soft wax feed and the timber a wax clean/seal/buff.

Then wrapped /covered with bubble wrap and/or soft storage blankets.

**Estimated Cost\* : £1540-to-£1680.**

### **Option Two:**

**- part storage /part display.**

Clean/dry as in Option One, plus;

Choose to fully restore one example of each armchair; one plain, one with a rosette carving and the one with the council motto carving.

This would include;

Removal of studs and leather.

Assessment of the condition of the internal stuffing and rejuvenate/supplement if necessary.

Refinish the timberwork – remove dents and scratches, reseal and finish wax.

Recover the seats and back pads with a similar style/colour of leather.

Re – stud.

**Estimated Cost \*\*/\*\*\* : £2580-to-£2800.**

### **Option Three :**

**- all to be displayed.**

Clean/dry as in Option One, plus;

Fully restore all fourteen armchairs as in Option Two above.

**Estimated Cost \*\*/\*\*\* : £4480-to-£5320.**

### **Notes :**

1. Work to be undertaken in my workshop.
2. \*\*Costs quoted include labour, insurance and all materials except the choice of leather.  
This is a difficult item to price as one has to order a full hide or hides and prices vary with the type /quality of leather chosen. A guide estimate for the leather needed if all armchairs were to be fully restored is; £650-to-£750, (plus vat/carriage).
3. \*Costs quoted do not include transport of chairs from/to PMAG and my workshop. The client can organise this or I can at a cost of approx.; £280-to-£320 per journey.
4. On completion of work and receipt of payment, a copy of the full work report, (with photographic record), will be given to the client.
5. The costing in this estimate is valid for one year from 19<sup>th</sup> November 2015.

## Crieff Chairs Community Consultation

### What should happen to the chairs?

The ownership of the chairs comes under Common Good

*(Common Good is the name given to the inherited property of the former burghs of Scotland and consists of a range of assets both moveable (furniture, paintings, regalia etc.) and heritable (land and buildings).*

As such the Crieff Common Good Fund Committee, whose membership comprises of Councillors Anne Younger (Convener), Rhona Brock, Ann Cowan, Ian Miller, Alan Grant are in a position to make a decision over the future of the chairs. To make the best possible decision, the committee will find it helpful to know what the people of Crieff think.

The Crieff and District Heritage Steering group will investigate all of the options for the chairs and write a report for the Crieff Common Good Fund Committee to consider.

Your thoughts are valued and we would be very grateful if you would take 5 minutes to write your thoughts on the paper provided and post it into the box.

Additional information;-

One quote has so far been received for refurbishing all 14 chairs which is approximately £3400

An application could be made to the Crieff Common Good Fund to pay for restoration and conservation of the chairs

Only the Provost's chair is of museum quality. Therefore Perth Museum and Art Gallery can only offer to care for the Provost's chair as part of the Perth and Kinross Museum collection.

Crieff Community Council would like to use the chairs in the future for Community Council business once there is a hub base for the community council.

Other suggestions have been made including, selling the chairs and donating the money to the Common Good Fund for future heritage projects.

Your contact details

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

---

Email address \_\_\_\_\_

Would you like us to inform you about the decision made by the Crieff Common Fund Committee

**Yes / No**